

**UNDER THE HEALTH AND DISABILITY
SERVICES ACT**

AND

**IN THE MATTER OF THE MINISTERIAL
INQUIRY INTO THE UNDER-REPORTING OF
CERVICAL SMEAR ABNORMALITIES**

CLOSING SUBMISSIONS OF WOMEN AFFECTED

BROOKFIELDS

Lawyers
A C M Fisher
Telephone No. 09 379 9350
Fax No. 09 379 3224
P O Box 240
DX CP24134
AUCKLAND & MANUKAU

Counsel Acting:

Stuart Grieve QC
Auckland
Telephone: 09 358 1716
Facsimile: 09 358 1718
P O Box 4555
DX CP20548

INDEX

1.	Introduction	1
2.	The Women Affected	4
3.	Preliminary Legal Issues	
	Introduction	6
	Admissibility	7
	The Terms of Reference	9
4.	Term of Reference 1 – Has there been an unacceptable level of under-reporting?	11
5.	Term of Reference 2 – Factors that led to this under-reporting	
	No adequate training/experience	13
	Lack of knowledge of appropriate screening method	14
	Failure to review patient’s earlier smears	14
	No accreditation, quality control or external quality assurance	14
	Health	15
6.	The False Negative Smear – The mindset that such errors are justifiable and do not raise competence issues	16
7.	The Lack Of Internal Morality	
	A breach of medical ethics	19
	Internal Morality	22
	Dr Tie	24
	Dr Teague	25
	Dr Linehan	31
	The failure to catalogue Gisborne slides to facilitate ‘look back’	33
8.	Why Was The Fact Of Dr Bottrill’s Significant Under-Reporting Not Detected Sooner?	37
9.	How Should The Wrongs Done Be Addressed?	
	Compensation	40